

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

GROVER WILLIAMS,	)	
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	
	)	
v.	)	Civil Action No. 04-24
	)	Judge Joy Flowers Conti/
DON HAWK, C.C.C. Director,	)	Magistrate Judge Amy Reynolds Hay
Gateway/Braddock,	)	
JIM BRENHOLTS, Work Release	)	
Counselor Gateway/Braddock,	)	
DENNIS RHODES, Director, PA	)	
D.O.C. Region 3 Contract	)	
Facility, WILLIAM MORSE, PA	)	
D.O.C. Contract Facility	)	
Coordinator,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	Re: Doc. # 30

ORDER

AND NOW, this 30th day of September, 2005, after the plaintiff, Grover C. Williams, filed an action in the above-captioned case, and after a Joint Motion for Judgment on the Pleadings was submitted by defendants, and after a Report and Recommendation was filed by the United States Magistrate Judge granting the parties ten days after being served with a copy to file written objections thereto, upon consideration of the objections filed by plaintiff, and upon independent review of the motion and the record, and upon consideration of the Magistrate Judge's Report and Recommendation, which is adopted as the opinion of this Court,

IT IS ORDERED that Defendants' Joint Motion for Judgment on the Pleadings is granted in part and denied in part. It is granted as to Defendants Rhodes and Morse as to all claims. It is granted as to Defendants Hawk and Brenholts as to Plaintiff's retaliation claims but

denied as to Plaintiff's Eighth Amendment deliberate indifference claims against Hawk and Brenholts.

/s/ Joy Flowers Conti  
JOY FLOWERS CONTI  
United States District Judge

cc: Honorable Amy Reynolds Hay  
United States Magistrate Judge

Grover Williams  
7533 Bennett Street  
Pittsburgh, PA 15208

Scott A. Bradley  
Deputy Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
6<sup>th</sup> Floor, Manor Complex  
564 Forbes Avenue  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219

James W. Harvey, Esq.  
Rosslyn Commons  
333 Baldwin Road  
Fifth Floor  
Pittsburgh, PA 15205

